

Tushar Allotments Collaboration
November 5, 2008 – 9:00 am – 5 pm
Beaver Ranger District Office

Meeting Notes
(items requiring follow-up are in red)

Action Items

- Next full collaboration meeting tentatively scheduled for Friday, 1/16/09. **Facilitator will revisit scheduling**, to determine whether a two-day window is possible in early to mid-January, so that some subgroups can meet in person before the full collaboration meeting.
- Aspen Regeneration subgroup – **conference call scheduled for 11/14, 9 am; subgroup's work to be completed before January collaboration meeting**
- Utilization / Forage Capacity subgroup – **to start meeting in early December (via conference call); subgroup's work to be completed before January collaboration meeting**
- Big Game / Livestock subgroup – **to meet in mid-November (via conference call) and identify available data before January collaboration meeting**
- **Remaining reports from summer field season** to be finalized and distributed to all collaboration members **ASAP**
 - Utilization measurements (Doug Sorensen and Jim Catlin)
 - Rooted nested frequency (Doug Sorensen)
 - Trend studies (Doug Sorensen)
 - RSRA reports (Jim Catlin)
 - Field observations (springs and other specific locations) (Doug Sorensen)
 - Price Spring report (Mary O'Brien or Doug Sorensen)
 - Cheat grass map (Ten Mile) – bring to next meeting
- **John Heyneman to write up report** on field trip with permittees, Doug Sorensen and John Keeler – expected mid-December. Report to focus on management ideas and movement of water.
- **January collaboration meeting** – summary of administrative process context that collaboration's efforts fit into – **Allen Rowley**
- **A USFS hydrologist will be asked to look at the following locations:**
 - Pine Creek / Sulphurbeds Allotment
 - North Wildcat Creek (possibly also a soil scientist)
 - Grassy Spring
 - Ten Mile Allotment
 - Order Canyon
 - Ten Mile Creek



- **Dipping Vat Spring** – entire area to be fenced off in **spring 2009**, with spring to be tied into existing pipeline. Combined **USFS / Pine Creek - Sulphurdale permittee** responsibility.
- **Cougar Spring** – old trough to be removed, and pipeline extended far beyond aspen stand; ensure that fence around the spring area is actually keeping livestock out. **Ten Mile permittee** responsibility.

Field Trip with John Heyneman

John Heyneman, manager of the North Rim Ranch owned by Grand Canyon Trust, spent two days in the field with permittees, John Keeler and Doug Sorensen in late September. The group observed over-utilization in both allotments, and discussed a variety of grazing management techniques to address the situation, including the possibility of reducing the total number of permitted cows. The group requested that John H. write a brief report summarizing the possible changes discussed, focusing in particular on grazing management and movement of water. All participants found the field trip informative and helpful.

Quick Impressions of Existing Conditions

Each participant was asked to give a quick summary of their impression of existing conditions on either allotment, based on individual observations in the field this summer. Note that following statements reflect individual opinions, not necessarily consensus conclusions, and therefore may be contradictory:

- Many physical facilities, such as fences and water facilities, are in disrepair.
- Grazing management practices – such as moving all cows in a timely fashion, providing water for cows outside riparian areas, appropriate placement of salt blocks – are not being consistently implemented.
- Due to the lack of forage, wildlife and livestock are grazing all vegetation species, including those with little nutritional value.
- Current conditions in these allotments reflect overuse by the combination of wildlife *and* livestock. On some sites, utilization of particular elements (e.g. aspen sprouts) is near or at standards before livestock have entered the pasture.
- Pasture that was properly rested this year looks like vegetation has recovered.
- Upland areas may have available forage, but are not currently being used to capacity.
- Existing conditions reflect 7+ years of drought.
- Some riparian areas are nearly denuded.
- Many aspen and riparian area willow and/or cottonwood are over-browsed.
- Some riparian areas that are not accessible to cattle or wildlife have dense, tall willow.
- Most acres of aspen are not sustainable in the existing condition.

Reintroduction of Beaver

Sean Kelly gave an update of the beaver reintroduction efforts this summer. A juvenile beaver was introduced earlier in the summer, and has not been seen since. Two mature beavers were released near the cutthroat enclosure the morning of the meeting (11/5/08). It is hoped that



placing them later in the season will encourage the beavers to stay in place over the winter. The Utah Division of Wildlife Resources will continue placing beaver in Pine Creek on an annual basis, beginning again in June 2009.

The two beaver released on the day of the meeting were taken from the Sevier River. UDWR is trying to identify locations in the Tushars to find beaver for this project.

Springs / Wetlands / Riparian Conditions and Functions

Individual springs, wetlands and other riparian areas on each allotment were discussed in some detail. Mary O'Brien showed representative photos, and all collaboration members shared their personal observations from the summer. Additional reports and photos will be submitted by other collaboration members. The objective of the discussion was to identify existing conditions at each individual site and begin exploring potential solutions. The sites identified include:

- Pine Creek / Sulphurbeds Allotment
 - Dipping Vat Spring
 - North Wildcat Creek
 - Wildcat Creek
 - Grassy Spring
 - Twitchell Creek
 - North Spring pipeline
 - Dead Cow Spring

- Ten Mile Allotment
 - Order Canyon
 - Bumblebee Spring
 - Cougar Spring
 - Price Spring
 - Ten Mile Creek
 - Little Park
 - City Creek from campground upstream
 - Anderson Spring
 - Green Ridge Spring

Upcoming USFS field reports on individual springs / wetlands / riparian locations will address the following questions:

- Is there a water development?
- Is it functional? If not, should it be? (Is it needed? Part of plan?)
- Is there riparian vegetation present or the potential?
- Is riparian vegetation meeting utilization standards?
- What's the suggested "fix"?
 - Estimate cost?
 - Who is responsible for implementation?
 - Timeline?
- How significant is this water development on the allotment? Priority no. 1 or lower priority?



Collaboration Administration

Doug Sorensen retirement. Doug Sorensen is scheduled to retire 1-2-09. Art Partridge will help out with forest planning. A new person will be hired to fill Doug Sorensen's position. The Forest Service plans to enter into a personal services contract with Doug to allow him to continue working with the collaboration until the final report is due in April 2009.

Future collaboration meetings.

Subgroups Formed. Three subgroups were created, the purpose of which is to assemble all relevant information assembled over the summer on the subgroup's topic for presentation to the full collaboration in a concise organized form. While any collaboration member is welcome to participate in the subgroups, many individual members are more interested in overall conclusions / areas of agreement / areas of disagreement. Those collaboration members more interested in the details of each topic volunteered to be a part of a subgroup.

- Aspen Regeneration subgroup – data analysis
 - Mary O'Brien (scheduler)
 - Bob Campbell
 - John Carter
 - Jim Catlin
 - Chad Horman
 - Wayne Hoskisson
 - Allen Rowley

- Utilization / Forage Capacity subgroup – data analysis
 - Art Partridge (scheduler)
 - Wyatt Barnson
 - John Carter
 - Jim Catlin
 - Chad Horman
 - Wayne Hoskisson
 - John Keeler
 - Mary O'Brien
 - Doug Sorensen

- Big Game / Livestock subgroup – what data exists to document wildlife activity / preferential use areas on each allotment?
 - Steve Flinders (scheduler)
 - John Carter
 - Wayne Hoskisson
 - Sean Kelly

Administrative Process Primer. Several questions were raised about how discrete USFS approvals and processes fit within NEPA, and how the collaboration's efforts relate to future USFS management decisions. Some also wondered whether and how the collaboration members will be involved in implementation of collaboration recommendations post-April 2009, as well as future adaptive management decisions.



Allen Rowley agreed to give a brief administrative process primer at the next full collaboration meeting.

Next Full Collaboration Meeting. The next full collaboration meeting was tentatively scheduled for Friday, January 16, 2009, 9 am – 5 pm. This date did not fit in everyone's schedule, and there was discussion about the need for two days of meetings. [NOTE: Since the collaboration meeting in Beaver, and following the first subgroup conference call, it is likely that some subgroups will need to meet in person before the next full collaboration meeting. The facilitator will revisit scheduling to determine whether a two-day meeting in early to mid-January is feasible.]

Topics for Collaboration Discussion. The following topics were identified as needing discussion in order to draft collaboration recommendations:

- Utilization / forage capacity
- Aspen regeneration
- Big game / livestock
- Recreation impact on landscape
- Springs / wetlands / riparian conditions and functions (including cottonwood and willow browsing)
- Cheat grass
- Ten Mile Pasture
- Wildcat Pasture (i.e., the portion containing Wildcat, North Wildcat, Twitchell and Grassy Creeks)
- Management practices
- Reintroduction of beaver
- Long-term monitoring (including responses to results showing lack of implementation or efficacy)

Posting Documents to Public Website. The following guidelines were suggested for writing up summer field notes, to minimize the subjectivity of reports:

- Methodology should be identified;
- Pictures should be tied to specific locations, preferably GPS-linked;
- Observations should be exact and specific;
- Comparisons with observations made in previous years should be made from the same reference point, to the extent possible.

The page on the public website containing reports from this summer's field work will include the following disclaimer:

Personal conclusions in these reports are those of the author only. They may not have been reviewed or approved by the full collaboration, and do not necessarily represent conclusions of the Tushar Allotments Collaboration.

Clarification of Terminology

As used by the Forest Service, the term "trespass" refers to livestock on Forest Service lands that are not owned by a Forest Service permittee. This would include a BLM permittee's livestock grazing on Forest Service lands (assuming the BLM permittee does not also hold a Forest Service permit).



The term “unauthorized use” refers to livestock owned by a Forest Service permittee that may be grazing in excess numbers, outside of the permitted season, found in areas for which they are not permitted (“the wrong place”), or different kind of livestock than permitted. These are all forms of noncompliance with the permit.

There is significance to the proper use of terminology due to the Forest Service’s enforcement authority and method of enforcement. The Forest Service deals with “unauthorized use” administratively through permit actions. It deals with “trespass” through enforcement channels by issuing citations.

11/5 Meeting Participants

Wyatt Barnson, Ten Mile Permittee
Bob Campbell, USFS
Jim Catlin, Wild Utah Project
John Carter, Western Watersheds Project
Rose Chilcoat, Great Old Broads for Wilderness
Steve Flinders, USFS
Chad Horman, USFS
Wayne Hoskisson, Utah Chapter Sierra Club
John Keeler, Utah Farm Bureau
Sean Kelly, UT Division of Wildlife Resources
Terry Krasko, USFS
K.L. McIff, Ten Mile Permittee
Mary O’Brien, Grand Canyon Trust
Art Partridge, USFS
Allen Rowley, USFS
Doug Sorenson, USFS
Donald Willden, Beaver County Commissioner
Lee R Yardley, Pine Creek / Sulphurbeds Permittee
Selena Yardley, Pine Creek / Sulphurbeds Permittee
John Zapell, USFS
Michele Straube, Facilitator



Tushar Allotments Collaboration

November 5, 2008 – 9:00 am – 5 pm
Beaver Ranger District Office

AGENDA

Meeting Objectives:

- Confirm existing conditions and data to support it
- Identify areas of concern
- Identify desired conditions
- Begin discussion on management practices to reach desired conditions
- Collaboration administrative issues
- Identify next steps

9:00–9:30 Welcome / Summary of Field Season Activities

9:30-9:45 Beaver Update

9:45-12:15 Pine Creek / Sulphurbeds Allotment

??? **BREAK**

12:15-12:45 **LUNCH** (make-your-own provided by facilitator)

12:45-3:15 Ten Mile Allotment

3:15-3:30 **BREAK**

3:30-5:00 Collaboration Administration

- Personnel changes
- Next steps
 - Meetings
 - Report writing
 - Budget
- Posting summer field results to public website

NOTE: times are estimated; to be used by facilitator as guidelines

